

DOCUMENT RESUME

ED 215 932

SO 014 008

AUTHOR Woodward, Arthur
TITLE The Analysis of Textbooks to Discover Content and Value Changes: Identifying Representative Textbooks.
PUB DATE Feb 82
NOTE 16p.; For a related document, see ED 199 173. Paper presented at the Annual Meeting of the American Educational Research Association (New York, NY, March, 1982).
EDRS PRICE MF01/PC01 Plus Postage.
DESCRIPTORS Content Analysis; Educational Change; Educational Research; History Textbooks; *Political Socialization; *Research Methodology; School Role; Secondary Education; Social Change; Social Values; Textbook Content; *Textbook Evaluation; *United States History
IDENTIFIERS *Fitzgerald (Frances)

ABSTRACT

This paper suggests that some of the U.S. history textbooks selected and analyzed by Frances Fitzgerald in her research on the political socialization function of U.S. history ("America Revised," 1979) were never widely used in schools and that the results of her study are, therefore, unrepresentative. The paper also presents a methodology for textbook selection that will enable future researchers studying political socialization to analyze only textbooks widely used in schools. For the period 1900 to 1930, Fitzgerald identified 13 U.S. history textbooks which then formed the data base for her discussion of changing values and content during the 1900-1930 period. To determine if these 13 texts were indeed being used in schools during this time period, the author of this paper conducted his own study. His data came from two sources: (1) annual reports of school districts housed in the Annual Report College of Teachers College, Columbia University; and (2) surveys of schools and their curricula conducted during this period. His findings--specific U.S. history titles--are discussed. The author found that seven of the 13 textbooks selected by Fitzgerald for analysis were never widely used in schools between 1900 and 1930. Fitzgerald's inclusion of obscure and little-used textbooks would suggest that her generalizations for the time period between 1900 and 1930 should be treated with caution. The author recommends that future researchers use annual reports of school districts and school surveys when trying to identify textbooks widely used in schools, for these two sources contain extensive data on textbook adoptions in schools. (Author/RM)

* Reproductions supplied by EDRS are the best that can be made *
* from the original document. *

ED215932

U.S. DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATION
NATIONAL INSTITUTE OF EDUCATION
EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES INFORMATION
CENTER (ERIC)

☒ This document has been reproduced as
received from the person or organization
originating it.

☐ Minor changes have been made to improve
reproduction quality.

• Points of view or opinions stated in this docu-
ment do not necessarily represent official NIE
position or policy.

THE ANALYSIS OF TEXTBOOKS TO DISCOVER CONTENT AND VALUE CHANGES:

IDENTIFYING REPRESENTATIVE TEXTBOOKS

"PERMISSION TO REPRODUCE THIS
MATERIAL HAS BEEN GRANTED BY

Arthur Woodward

Arthur Woodward

EPIE Institute

TO THE EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES
INFORMATION CENTER (ERIC)."

(Presented at the Annual Meeting of AERA, New York City, March 1982)

February 1982

50 014 008

The Analysis of Textbooks to Discover Content and Value Changes:

Identifying Representative Textbooks

The role of the school in transmitting social and political values to succeeding generations of students has been a topic of persistent scholarly interest. In the absence of actually being able to observe the classroom itself scholars have turned to the teaching tool that most clearly reflects teaching and learning in the classroom--the textbook. Thus, by analyzing the content of the textbook it has been possible to identify the values taught to students and the changes in these values from generation to generation. Although all school subjects have values embedded in their content and their textbooks, the political socialization function of the school is clearest in the subject of history, especially U.S. History.

U.S. History is rightly considered as the subject through which the political, social and economic heritage of the nation is transmitted and together with Civics both are considered essential preparation for citizenship. Thus, with the important role of history in the political socialization process, it is not surprising that many studies have been undertaken that seek to identify and trace the values embedded in history and its textbooks. The work of Fitzgerald (1979), Cremer (1963), Bechtel (1968), and Fedyck (1979) and others exemplify this approach.

Valuable as this approach is, little concern has been expressed about the methodological problems of selecting and analyzing textbooks. For any given period, in any given subject, numerous textbooks are available for schools to adopt. Yet, some textbooks are rarely adopted whereas others enjoy widespread popularity. In a recent analysis of the Annual Reports of numerous school districts housed in the Annual Report Collection of Teachers College, Columbia

University, it was found that between 1880 and 1930 forty-four U.S. History textbooks were cited as used--and no doubt additional textbooks were available for adoption, but not cited in the Annual Reports. However, twenty-eight of these history textbooks were mentioned only once or twice for only one or two years by schools; other textbooks were reported used in U.S. History courses by numerous schools for many years (Woodward, 1982).

The selection of textbooks for analysis is therefore important if textbooks are to be included that truly represent those used in schools; the inclusion of some of the twenty-eight 'unpopular' textbooks mentioned above would clearly skew the data. Anything less than analyzing textbooks that were widely used in schools must inevitably result in less than reliable data on the values taught to students through their textbooks. Further, the mixing of popular and less popular textbooks in the textbook sample and the consequent 'averaging' of the information gleaned from them can only result in a dilution of data.

This paper, then, will describe an alternative to the 'impressionistic' selection of textbooks for analysis and will compare the textbooks used by Fitzgerald as the data base for her book, America Revised (1979) with data collected by Woodward (1982) on textbooks used in high school U.S. History courses.

For the period 1900 to 1930 (a period of textbook writing and publishing specifically identified by Fitzgerald and one where data from Woodward intersect), Fitzgerald identified thirteen U.S. History textbooks which then formed the data base for her discussion of changing values and content during the 1900-1930 period (see Table 1). Of these thirteen textbooks nine were first published during or after 1917 and the other three were first published between 1900 and 1916. Seven of the thirteen textbooks discussed by Fitzgerald--

Table 1

Fitzgerald's United States History Texts: 1900-1930

Ashley, Roscoe Lewis. American History. New York: Macmillan, new and revised, 1924. First edition, 1907.

Beard, Charles A., and William C. Bagley. The History of the American People. New York: Macmillan, revised 1923. First edition, 1918.

Beard, Charles, and Mary R. Beard. History of the United States: A Study in American Civilization. New York: Macmillan, 1923. First edition, 1921.

Bourne, Henry Eldridge, and Elbert Jay Benton. A History of the United States. New York: D.C. Heath, 1925. First edition, 1913.

Fish, Carl Russell. History of America. New York: American Book Company, 1925.

Guitteau, William Backus. Our United States: A History. New York: Silver Burdett, 1923. First edition, 1919.

Halleck, Reuben Post. History of Our Country for Higher Grades. New York: American Book Company, 1923.

Hart, Albert Bushnell. New American History. New York: American Book Company, 1917.

_____. School History of the United States. New York: American Book Company, revised 1928. First edition, 1918.

Hurlbert, Archer Butler. United States History. Garden City: Doubleday, Page, 1923.

Shortridge, Wilson Porter. The Development of the United States. New York: Macmillan, 1929.

Tryon, Rolla M., and Charles R. Lingley. The American People and Nation. Boston: Ginn, 1927.

West, Willis Mason. American History and Government. Boston: Allyn & Bacon, 1913.

Source: Fitzgerald, Frances. America Revised, Boston: Little, Brown, 1979, p. 228.

Bourne & Benton's A History of the United States (1913), Fish's History of America (1925), Halleck's A History of Our Country for Higher Grades (1923), Hurlbert's United States History (1923), Shortridge's The Development of the United States (1929), Tryon & Lingley's The American People and Nation (1927), and Beard & Bagley's The History of the American People (1918) were, according to data collected by this author, never widely used in schools between 1900 and 1930. Indeed, the Annual Reports of several hundred school districts and other sources rarely mentioned these textbooks. Furthermore, there was no mention of Fiske's History of the United States (1894), Channing's Students History of the United States (1898), Forman's Advanced American History (1914), Montgomery's Students American History (1890) or McMaster's School History of the United States (1897) (the latter two were placed in the nineteenth century textbook section). Certainly, for this period, there is evidence to suggest that these textbooks enjoyed some popularity. In the case of Ashley's American History, Beard & Beard's History of the United States, Guiteau's Our United States, Hart's New American History and School History of the United States and West's American History and Government, there is evidence that these books were used in a number of schools. Certainly, for this period, Fitzgerald's inclusion of obscure and little-used textbooks would suggest that her generalizations should be treated with caution.

Evidence of which textbooks were used in high school U.S. History was collected by this author for the period 1880 to 1930. Data came from two sources; the first was from information gleaned from the numerous Annual Reports of school districts (and thus high schools) housed in the Annual Report College of Teachers College, Columbia University. These Reports covered the period 1850 to 1950 and were representative of most areas of the country. Some Reports

covered only one year, others covered several decades and while these Reports contained a great variety of information on the high school, ranging from enrollment data to the curriculum and the qualifications of teachers, only history textbook and history course data (Ancient History, Medieval and Modern History, English History, World History, and U.S. History) were identified and then only for the fifty years between 1880 and 1930. Data tended to cluster in the 1880-1916 period. The second source of data was taken from the many surveys of schools and their curricula conducted during this period, but especially prevalent after 1915.

These two sources of data resulted in a fairly comprehensive picture of which textbooks were widely used in high school U.S. History. It was clear that there was a vast distance between the number of textbooks available for adoption and those textbooks extensively used in schools.

According to Annual report and survey data from 1900 to 1910, Montgomery's Students History of the United States, Fiske's A History of the United States, Channing's A Student's History of the United States were widely used. After 1910 Muzzey's American History, James & Sanford's American History, Hart's American History, Ashley's History of the United States, Adams & Trent's A History of the United States, Forman's American History, and Fite's History of the United States were widely used in schools.

The data from the Annual Reports (Table 2) clearly reflect the primacy of Montgomery, Channing and Fiske, at least until 1910 and thereafter the new generation of textbooks led by Hart and to a lesser extent Muzzey. More impressive perhaps is the data from various surveys; data collected by Smollens' (1970) study of textbooks used in U.S. History courses in Nebraska high schools (Table 3) show that Channing's A Student's History of the United States,

Table 2
Teachers College Annual Reports
United States History Textbooks, 1900-1930

	1900	01	02	03	04	05	06	07	08	09	10	11	12	13	14	15	16	17	18	19	20	21	22	23	24	25	26	27	28	29	30	
Montgomery	9	8	9	14	4	8	10	11	2	6	4	2	7	1	2																	
Huzzey													1	1	5	6	4	6	2	2	2	2	1	2	2	3	1	1	2	2	1	
McMaster	3	1	3	7	4	4	2	1	2	2	1	1	3	3	1	1	1		1													
McLaughlin	4	2	2	7	9	5	7	6	6	5	6	4	1	4	3	3	5	2	3	1			1									
Johnston	1	1	1	2							1																					
James & Sanford									1	2	1	1	3	2	4	3	4															
Hart							4	5	5	10	10	13	7	6	5	5	3	2	3	2	2	1	2									
Fiske (Critical Periods)	1	2	2	2	1	1	1	1	2	2	2	2	1																			
Fiske	9	8	8	9	5	6	1	3		2	1			1	1	1																
Channing	6	4	7	11	12	11	11	7	5	2	9	3	6	2	1	3	1	1														
Barnes	2		2	2	3	1				1																						
Ashley													1	1		1	5	4	3	1	1	1										
Anderson																																
Adams & Trent					2	1	1	2	1	2	2	1	4	3	1	1	2	1														
Others	4	6	6	8	6	1	1	2	3	2	3	1	4	4	4	4	5	0	2	2	0	2	1	3	2	3	0	2	1	2	1	
N =	39	32	40	62	44	39	38	39	28	36	39	28	37	28	28	32	29	15	12	8	5	5	5	5	4	6	1	3	3	4	2	

Table 3
United States History
Textbooks Used In Nebraska High Schools, 1899-1920

	1899 1900	1900 1901	1901 1902	1902 1903	1903 1904	1904 1905	1905 1906	1906 1907	1907 1908	1908 1909	1909 1910	1910 1911	1911 1912	1912 1913	1913 1914	1914 1915	1915 1916	1916 1917	1917 1918	1918 1919	1919 1920
Channing	2 1	6.2 11	10.9 16	15.4 17	17.9 21	20.8 22	24.2 31	26.7 30	22.7 33	22.3 48	30. 27	12.8 28	13.3	11.6 29	9.4 32	11. 37	12.1 45	8.9 23	12.4 50	8.5 38	7.3 35
Montgomery	2 1	6.2 14	13.9 8	7.7 8	8.4 11	10.9 7	7.7 10	8.6 14	10.6 18	12.2 24	15. 33	15.6 39	18.6	12.4 31	10. 34	9.8 33	7.8 29	7.7 20	3.7 15	3.6 16	2.3 11
McMaster	2 2	12.5 17	16.8 21	20.2 20	21. 26	25.7 18	19.8 14	12.1 17	12.9 21	14.2 18	11.2 20	9.5 21	10.	5.6 14	7. 24	4.4 15	3.8 14	1.9 5	2.2 9	2.2 10	2. 10
Hart	2 1	1. 1	1.9 2	1. 1	1.9 2	1.1 1	11.2 13	17.4 23	21.6 32	27.5 44	28. 59	31.4 66		33.2 83	25. 85	23.7 80	23.1 86	19.7 51	17.9 72	16.8 75	15.4 74
Muzzey	2													2.4 6	9.1 31	11.7 40	13.7 51	21.6 56	18.8 76	19.5 87	17.5 84
James & Sanford	2														.6 2	1.5 5	1.9 7	1.9 5	5.7 23	4.9 22	5.8 28
West	2															1.5 5	1.9 7	3. 8	4.5 18	7.9 35	10. 48
Others		12	58	57	49	41	43	48	48	44	26	72	56	87	132	122	133	91	140	162	189
Total	16	101	104	95	101	91	116	132	148	160	211	210		250	340	337	372	259	403	445	479

Source: Smolens, Richard. *The Source Study Method of Teaching History in Nebraska*. Unpublished dissertation, Columbia University, 1970. Pp 127, 193, 280.

Montgomery's Leading Facts of American History, McMaster's A School History of the United States, and Hart's Essentials in American History were well represented in schools for most of the 1899-1920 period. Channing and, when it was introduced, Hart were the most popular of the textbooks used between 1899 and 1910. After 1910, Hart's Essentials in American History and Muzzey's An American History were the most popular textbooks, followed by Channing's A Student's History of the United States and West's American History and Government.

Brooks' (1916) survey of textbooks used in Georgia high schools found that thirty-two schools reported using thirteen textbooks in U.S. History courses. The most popular were Adams & Trent's A History of the United States used in eight (25%) of schools, and Stephenson's A Short History of the United States used in five (15.6%) schools.

Monroe & Foster's (1922) survey of 475 high schools received 356 responses which included information on U.S. History textbook use. As can be seen from Table 4, Muzzey's American History was by far the most popular textbook with 195 (54.8%) of schools reporting its use. Fite's History of the United States was the closest rival with forty-seven (13.2%) schools using this textbook. The dominance of Muzzey was even more pronounced in the Missouri high schools surveyed by Hartwig (1922). Of the eighty-nine schools reporting, seventy (78.6%) used Muzzey; the nearest competitors were Hart's New American History and West's American History and Government which were each used in five (5.6%) schools.

Murphy's (1923) survey of textbook use in Massachusetts high schools found that Ashley's History of the United States was used in thirteen schools (7.8%), Channing's A Student's History of the United States in eighteen (10.8%),

Table 4

United States History

Textbooks Used in 356 High Schools of the North Central Association, 1922

Textbook	# schools	%
Muzzey <u>American History</u>	195	54.8
Fite <u>History of the United States</u>	47	13.2
Forman <u>Advanced American History</u>	33	9.3
West <u>American History</u>	30	8.4
McLaughlin <u>History of the American Nation</u>	30	8.4
Hart <u>New American History</u>	21	5.9

n = 356

Source: Monroe, Walter S. & Foster, I.O. The Status of the Social Sciences in the High Schools of the North Central Association. Bureau of Educational Research, Bulletin No. 13, University of Illinois, Urbana, 1922, p. 32.

Fite's History of the United States in fourteen (8.4%), Hart's New American History in seventeen (10.2%), and Muzzey's American History in thirty-seven (22.4%) schools. Smith (1923) found that Muzzey's American History was the most widely used textbook in all Colorado high schools, with thirty of forty-five schools (66.6%) using it; Hart's, West's, Channing's and McLaughlin's textbooks trailed far behind with less than five schools using each book.

Texas (1979) adopted Latane's History of the United States for the years 1924-28; 57,735 copies were sold to Texan high schools. For the 1929-30 school year, Texas selected three textbooks for adoption--Fite's History of the United States (selling 22, 620 copies), Muzzey's History of the American People (selling 38,503 copies), and Beard's History of the United States (selling 11,003 copies). In Kansas, Malin (1927) reported that Forman's Advanced American History was adopted for U.S. History in all Kansas high schools for 1925-30.

Conclusion

The data on the adoption of U.S. History textbooks presented above represents a start in identifying textbooks widely used in schools. In the absence of accessible school district records, chaotic state adoption policies and the unavailability of publishing companies' publication and sales records, the data reported above provide an important data base from which scholarly studies of the transmission of certain values in textbooks can proceed. Clearly, the Annual Reports and other sources are not as comprehensive as we would like (a more extensive and sophisticated analysis of the Annual Reports in the Annual Report Collection of Teachers College is planned). However, in the absence of other information on textbooks used in schools the data presented represents

a useful standard from which to judge previous studies. For as this brief analysis of Fitzgerald (1979) has shown, generalizations based on the analysis of textbooks not widely used in schools, must be treated with caution.

Bibliography

- Bechtel, Donald L. An Analysis of Selected Civic Attitudes in High School American History, Geography, and Civics Textbooks, 1885-1914. Unpublished Dissertation, University of South Dakota, 1968.
- Brooks, R.P. History Teaching in Georgia High Schools. The High School Quarterly, April 1916, Vol. IV, No. 3, p. 217-221.
- Cremer, Robert D. An Analysis of the Development of High School World History Textbooks and Enrollments from 1900 to 1959. Unpublished Dissertation, University of South Dakota, 1963.
- Fedyck, Micheline. Conceptions of Citizenship and Nationality in High School American History Textbooks, 1913-1979. Unpublished Dissertation, Columbia University, 1979.
- Fitzgerald, Frances. America Revised. Boston: Little, Brown, 1979.
- Hartwig, Caroline E. The Place of the Social Studies in the High Schools of Missouri. The Historical Outlook, Vol. XIII, No. 9, 1922, p. 339-342.
- Malin, James C. The Status of the Historical and Social Sciences in Kansas High Schools. The Historical Outlook, Vol. XVIII, No. 1, January 1927, p. 22-28.
- Monroe, Walter S. & Foster, I.O. The Status of the Social Sciences in the High Schools of the North Central Association. Bulletin No. 13, Bureau of Educational Research, College of Education, University of Illinois, 1922.
- Murphy, Joseph M. The New England Survey--Massachusetts. Historical Outlook, Vol. XIV, No. 9, December 1923, p. 363-369.
- Smolens, Richard. The Source Study Method of Teaching History In Nebraska. Unpublished Dissertation, Columbia University, 1970.
- Texas, Texas Education Agency, Department of Education, Private Communication, 1979.
- Woodward, Arthur. Teaching Americans About Their Past: History in Schools, 1880-1930. Unpublished Doctoral Dissertation, University of Illinois, Urbana-Champaign, IL, 1982.

Bibliography of U.S. History Textbooks

- Adams, Charles Kendall & Trent, William P. A History of the United States. Boston: Allyn & Bacon, 1903.
- Ashley, Rosco Lewis. American History. New York: Macmillan, 1907.
- Barnes, A.S. Brief History of the United States. New York: A.S. Barnes, 1871.
- Beard, Charles A. & Beard, Mary R. History of the United States. New York: Macmillan Co., 1921.
- Beard, Charles A. & Bagley, William C. The History of the American People. New York, Macmillan, 1918.
- Bourne, Henry Eldridge & Benton, Elbert J. A History of the United States. New York: D.C. Heath, 1913.
- Channing, Edward A Student's History of the United States. New York: Macmillan Co., 1898.
- Fish, Carl Russell. History of America. New York: American Book Company, 1925.
- Fiske, John. A History of the United States for Schools. Boston: Houghton Mifflin, 1894.
- Fiske, John. Critical Periods of American History. Boston: Houghton Mifflin & Co., 1888.
- Fite, Emerson David. History of the United States. New York: Holt & Co., 1916.
- Forman, Samuel E. Advanced American History. New York: Century, 1914.
- Guitteau, William Backus. Our United States: A History. New York: Silver Burdett, 1919.
- Halleck, Reuben Post. History of Our Country for Higher Grades. New York: American Book Company, 1923.
- Hart, Albert Bushnell. New American History. New York: American Book Company, 1917.
- _____. School History of the United States. New York: American Book Company, revised 1918.
- Hurlbert, Archer Butler. United States History. Garden City: Doubleday, Page, 1923.

James, James Alton & Sanford, Albert Hart. American History. New York: Charles Scribners Sons, 1909.

Latane, John Holladay. A History of the United States. Boston: Allyn & Bacon, 1918.

McLaughlin, Andrew C. A History of the American Nation. New York: Appleton & Co., 1899.

McMaster, John B. A School History of the United States. New York: American Book Co., 1897.

Montgomery, David N. Leading Facts of American History. Boston: Ginn & Co., 1890.

Muzzey, David Saville. An American History. Boston: Ginn, 1911.

_____. History of the American People. Boston: Ginn & Co., 1921.

West, Willis Mason. American History and Government. Boston: Allyn & Bacon, 1913.